

**Written review by the official reviewer**  
**of Kenzhegulova Gaukhar Koblanovna's dissertation on the topic: «The role of women social behaviour transformation in Public Administration» for a doctor of philosophy (PhD) in the educational program 8D04101 – Public and Local Administration.**

No	Criteria	Compliance with the criteria (underline one of the options)	Justification of the Position of the Official Reviewer (comments should be italicized)
1.	The topic of the dissertation (as of the date of its approval) corresponds to the directions of scientific development and/or state programs.	<p>1.1 Compliance with priority areas of science development or government programs:</p> <p>1) the dissertation was completed within the framework of a project or target program funded from the state budget (specify the name and number of the project or program);</p> <p><b>2) the dissertation was completed within the framework of another state program (specify the name of the program);</b></p> <p>3) the dissertation corresponds to the priority area of science development approved by the Higher Scientific and Technical Commission under the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan (specify the direction).</p>	<p>The topic of the dissertation research reflects the process of institutional transformation of women's social activism and its impact on the effectiveness of public administration in socially sensitive sectors.</p> <p>The object of analysis is the forms of sustainable female activity which, under conditions of regulatory constraints and organizational uncertainty, function as a tool to enhance the effectiveness of public administration. Particular attention is given to cases in which such forms of activity compensate for the lack of organizational decisions—for example, in the development of palliative care, where the establishment of new administrative practices occurred in areas not initially provided for by existing administrative mechanisms.</p> <p>The study considers women's social activism not as episodic participation, but as a form of organized and substantively oriented activity capable of initiating managerial change, forming new procedures, and strengthening the adaptive capacity of public structures. This transformation is regarded as a significant condition for increasing effectiveness in the implementation of social policy.</p> <p>The research topic directly corresponds to the directions of implementation of the following programmatic and strategic documents:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>– Address of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan, K.-J. Tokayev, to the people of Kazakhstan "Just Kazakhstan: Law and Order, Economic Growth, Public Optimism" dated September 2, 2024;</li> <li>– Concept for the Development of Public Administration in the Republic of Kazakhstan until 2030: Building a "Human-Centered" Model – "People First";</li> <li>– National Action Plan of the Republic of Kazakhstan to Promote Equal Rights and Opportunities for Men and Women for 2024–2027;</li> <li>– State Program for the Development of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan for 2020–2025, which provides for the expansion of social support mechanisms and the inclusion of the civil sector, in particular through initiatives in the field of palliative care;</li> <li>– Concept of Family and Gender Policy in the Republic of Kazakhstan until 2030.</li> </ul> <p>Thus, the topic of the dissertation corresponds to the strategic priorities outlined in national program documents, including areas of development in public and local administration, as well as gender policy and sustainable social development.</p>
2.	Importance for science	The work <b>makes</b> / does not make a significant contribution to science, and	The work makes a significant contribution to the advancement of science by revealing the processes of transformation of women's social activism within the sphere of public administration. The study consistently traces the evolution of theoretical and methodological

		its importance is well disclosed / not disclosed.	<p>foundations for analyzing women's social activity, which is considered not as spontaneous behavior but as a stable format of participation in the formation of administrative decisions. A review of scholarly approaches is conducted, which substantiates the specific features of the institutionalization of women's social activism.</p> <p>The conceptual framework is systematized; the key forms of women's social activism are identified, as well as the constraints that hinder the development of its stable institutional forms within the system of public and local administration in Kazakhstan.</p> <p>In the presented scientific research, the transformation of women's social activism is viewed as a process of shaping sustainable forms of women's participation in the public administration system, capable of enhancing its effectiveness in socially significant areas:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>– the author's interpretation of women's social activism is presented as a form of sustainable participation that contributes to the transformation of socio-economic practices and institutional relations in the system of public and local administration. The role of women's activity in entrepreneurship, education, and the formation of social institutions that ensure their inclusion in public and local governance processes is disclosed;</li> <li>– an economic-mathematical model is developed, describing the relationship between the level of women's social activism and indicators of public administration effectiveness, using regression analysis;</li> <li>– an institutional mechanism for partnership-based interaction between public structures and women's associations is proposed, tested on a case in the field of palliative care, and possessing the potential for expansion into other areas of social policy;</li> <li>– factors determining the conditions for the development of women's social activism in administrative decision-making processes are systematized, considering the level of education, administrative environment, and forms of interaction with bodies of public and local administration;</li> <li>– practice-oriented mechanisms are proposed for transforming women's social activity into institutionalized forms of participation that address resource and organizational deficits and enable the implementation of tasks of public and local administration in socially sensitive sectors.</li> </ul>
3.	Principle of independence	<p>Level of independence:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1) <b>high;</b></li> <li>2) medium;</li> <li>3) low;</li> <li>4) no independence.</li> </ol>	<p>The dissertation is characterized by a high level of doctoral student's independence. In the course of the research, an original formulation of the scientific problem was proposed, the author's interpretation of key concepts was substantiated, and an independent approach to the interpretation of theoretical and empirical data was developed. The results obtained demonstrate a high degree of scientific novelty and make a significant contribution to the development of public administration theory through the study of the transformation of women's social activism. The presented findings complement existing scientific approaches in the field of social policy and institutional planning.</p>
4.	Principle of internal coherence	<p>4.1 Justification of the relevance of the dissertation:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1) <b>justified;</b></li> </ol>	<p>The structure of the dissertation is distinguished by substantive coherence and thematic completeness. All sections are logically organized in accordance with the research objective</p>

		<p>2) partially justified; 3) not justified.</p>	<p>and provide a comprehensive exposition of the issue of transforming women's social activism into the system of public and local administration.</p> <p>The relevance of the chosen direction is determined by the need to enhance the effectiveness of institutional governance mechanisms through the integration of stable forms of women's social activity in the implementation of socially significant tasks. The study demonstrates how women's activism can be transformed into administrative practice, addressing deficits in resources, initiatives, and feedback across several key areas of social policy.</p> <p>The object of the dissertation research is the processes of formation and institutional development of women's social activity within the public and local administration system. The subject of the research is the organizational and economic relations that emerge as women participate in solving administrative tasks in the social sphere.</p> <p>The study encompasses forms of women's social activism aimed at compensating for resource and organizational deficits in public and local administration. It examines actions and models of participation that promote the development of institutionalized mechanisms for interaction between women and public authorities, as well as increased transparency and accountability in administrative processes.</p> <p>Women's activity in the field of social policy is analyzed as a factor in increasing the resilience of the administrative system, enabling institutional replenishment of governance resources without the need to create new formal institutions. This approach positions women's social activity as a component of effective public administration, integrated into the existing organizational and legal framework.</p> <p>The dissertation presents substantiated approaches to the institutional consolidation of women's social activism within the system of public and local administration, which underscores its practical relevance and orientation toward solving managerial tasks.</p>
		<p>4.2 The content of the dissertation reflects the topic of the dissertation: 1) <b>reflects</b>; 2) partially reflects; 3) does not reflect.</p>	<p>The content of the dissertation corresponds to the stated topic and reveals the process of transformation of women's social activism as part of the mechanisms of public and local administration. The structure and sequence of the chapters ensure a coherent examination of theoretical foundations and applied aspects reflecting the institutional and organizational-economic characteristics of women's participation in addressing public and local governance tasks.</p> <p><b>The first chapter</b> examines theoretical and methodological approaches to analyzing the transformation of women's social behavior, including the evolution of scientific perspectives on social activity and the mechanisms of women's integration into public administration processes. Particular attention is given to how social activism is shaped as a stable form of participation in managerial tasks.</p> <p><b>The second chapter</b> provides an empirical assessment of the forms of women's participation in the activities of public administration bodies in Kazakhstan. Educational and regulatory conditions that facilitate or hinder the development of women's social activism are analyzed, and institutional barriers that limit sustainable involvement in administrative processes are identified.</p>

			<p><b>The third chapter</b> substantiates directions for the institutionalization of women's social activity within the public administration system. Proposals are formulated to strengthen mechanisms of cross-sectoral interaction, develop conditions for sustainable participation, and expand institutional mechanisms for women's involvement in the public administration system through the use of educational, legal, and economic instruments.</p> <p>The conclusion summarizes the research findings and provides recommendations aimed at the practical application of women's social activism as an institutional resource in the governance of the social sphere.</p>
		<p>4.3. The objective and tasks correspond to the topic of the dissertation:</p> <p>1) <b>correspond;</b>  2) partially correspond;  3) do not correspond.</p>	<p>The aim of the dissertation research is to develop recommendations for strengthening women's social activity within the public administration system and for their integration into the implementation of public social programs in the Republic of Kazakhstan. This stated aim is logically consistent with the research topic and defines the orientation of both the theoretical and applied aspects of the analysis.</p> <p>To achieve the stated aim, the following objectives were formulated:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>– to examine the theoretical foundations of the formation and development of women's social activity in public administration, taking into account the characteristics of gender roles;</li> <li>– to systematize international experience in the institutionalization of women's activism and its application in administrative practice;</li> <li>– to conduct an empirical analysis of the impact of women's social activity on the effectiveness of public administration in Kazakhstan using correlation-regression methods and Z-score standardization of data;</li> <li>– to assess the extent to which women's educational attainment influences their participation in administrative processes;</li> <li>– to develop institutional approaches to supporting women's social activity and determine the conditions for its integration into public and local administrative practices;</li> <li>– to formulate practical recommendations for expanding women's participation in the implementation of public social programs.</li> </ul> <p>All the formulated objectives are addressed in the dissertation in a consistent and structured manner, ensuring that the content aligns with the research aim and highlighting the thematic coherence of the work.</p>
		<p>4.4 All sections and provisions of the dissertation are logically interconnected:</p> <p>1) <b>fully interconnected;</b>  2) partially interconnected;  3) not interconnected.</p>	<p>The content of the dissertation is characterized by internal coherence. All sections are structured in accordance with the stated aim, objectives, and methodology, which ensures the consistent development of the topic from theoretical premises to applied conclusions. The results obtained correspond to the selected approaches and the formulated managerial decisions, confirming the integrity and methodological validity of the research.</p>
		<p>4.5 The new solutions (principles, methods) proposed by the author are substantiated and evaluated in comparison with known solutions:</p>	<p>The solutions proposed by the doctoral candidate are based on theoretical and empirical analysis, correspond to research in the field of public administration, and are applicable to the tasks of enhancing effectiveness through the development of women's social activism within the public administration system.</p>

		1) <b>critical analysis is present;</b> 2) analysis is partial; 3) analysis consists not of original opinions but of quotations from other authors; 4) analysis is absent.	
5.	Principle of scientific novelty	5.1 Are the scientific results and provisions new? 1) <b>completely new;</b> 2) partially new (25–75% are new); 3) not new (less than 25% are new).	<p>The dissertation formulates a set of propositions that possess elements of scientific novelty and expand the theoretical and methodological foundations of public administration. The novelty of the research is manifested in the following aspects:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>– an original interpretation is proposed of women’s social activism as a form of social behavior transformation that can be institutionally embedded within the public administration system and used to compensate for deficiencies in governance mechanisms within the social sphere;</li> <li>– a quantitative approach is developed for measuring the transformation of women’s social activism and its institutional impact on the effectiveness of public functions, based on the application of correlation-regression analysis and data standardization using the Z-score method;</li> <li>– an economic-mathematical model is constructed, demonstrating the relationship between the level of institutionalization of women’s social activism, the educational characteristics of women involved in socially significant activities, and the effectiveness of administrative decisions, including those in the fields of healthcare and social policy;</li> <li>– the stages of institutional transformation of women’s social activism are analyzed using the case of palliative care development in Kazakhstan;</li> <li>– organizational and managerial provisions are formulated to ensure the structural integration of forms of women’s social activism into public administration mechanisms, taking into account regulatory requirements, personnel training, and the sustainability of applied solutions.</li> </ul>
		5.2 Are the conclusions of the dissertation new? 1) <b>completely new;</b> 2) partially new (25–75% are new); 3) not new (less than 25% are new)	<p>The conclusions and recommendations are formulated using scientific approaches applied in the field of public administration. The methodological framework includes an analysis of domestic and international sources containing concepts, applied models, and empirically validated developments aimed at studying the mechanisms of integrating women’s social activism into the system of public and local administration. The research results reflect stable correlations between forms of women’s social activity and the institutional conditions under which this activity is regarded as a resource for the development of public administration.</p> <p>An analysis of the dissertation’s propositions allows the conclusion that the findings possess scientific novelty. This novelty is ensured by a comprehensive approach that combines the development of an original interpretation of women’s social activism with the construction of a quantitative model enabling assessment of its institutionalization and managerial significance in the context of addressing social policy objectives.</p>

		<p>5.3 Technical, technological, economic or managerial decisions are new and justified:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1) <b>completely new</b>;</li> <li>2) partially new (25–75% are new);</li> <li>3) not new (less than 25% are new)</li> </ol>	<p>The managerial and organizational-economic solutions developed in the dissertation research are characterized by elements of novelty and are aimed at the institutional consolidation of women's social activity within the system of public and local administration. A model is substantiated for incorporating stable forms of women's social activism into the implementation of social policy objectives.</p> <p>Principles are formulated for adapting administrative structures to conditions of resource, personnel, and infrastructure shortages in their interaction with socially active women's associations, which contribute to compensating for functional limitations in the areas of healthcare, family policy, and care services. A systematic approach is proposed for integrating these forms of activity into existing administrative processes, encompassing institutional, human resource, and legal aspects.</p> <p>Additionally, conditions are identified under which stable women's social activity can be sustained and further developed within the framework of existing public administration mechanisms. Proposals are developed for legal and administrative support of institutionalization processes, taking into account international standards and national specificities, thereby revealing the potential of women's social activism to strengthen social cohesion and enhance the effectiveness of managerial decisions in the implementation of public programs.</p>
6.	Validity of the main conclusions	<p>All the main conclusions are <b>based</b> / not based on scientifically significant evidence or are well-founded enough (for qualitative research and areas of study in the arts and humanities)</p>	<p>The analysis of the dissertation research confirms the novelty of the formulated conclusions. The theoretical section substantiates the interpretation of women's social activism as a form of social behavior transformation oriented toward institutional consolidation within the system of public and local administration. The methodological framework combines quantitative and qualitative approaches, including cluster and regression analysis, indicator standardization, and interpretation of institutional characteristics. The empirical basis is constructed from statistical data, results of a conducted survey, and case analysis of women's participation in administrative processes within the social sector.</p> <p>The conclusions identify stable relationships between educational characteristics, types of social activity, and the conditions for their reproduction in administrative practice. The established findings expand scientific understanding of the mechanisms of women's engagement, confirm the applied potential of the proposed solutions, and can be utilized in the implementation of programs in the field of social policy.</p>
7.	The main provisions submitted for defense	<p>It is necessary to answer the following questions for each provision separately:</p> <p>7.1 Has the provision been proven?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1) <b>proven</b>;</li> <li>2) rather proven;</li> <li>3) rather not proven;</li> <li>4) not proven;</li> </ol>	<p>The propositions presented in the dissertation are <b>substantiated</b> and <b>validated</b> at the theoretical, empirical, and methodological levels. They are <b>not of a trivial nature</b> and represent <b>new scientific results</b> obtained through independent analysis. Each proposition is supported by research data, including quantitative calculations, institutional interpretation, and examples from administrative practice. The scope of applicability extends to the system of public and local administration. All propositions are reflected in the content of the dissertation and correspond to the declared research objectives.</p> <p>Proposition 1.</p>

		<p>5) in the current formulation, it is impossible to verify the validity of the provision.</p> <p>7.2 Is it trivial?</p> <p>1) yes;</p> <p>2) <b>no</b>;</p> <p>3) in the current formulation, it is impossible to verify the triviality of the provision.</p> <p>7.3 Is it new?</p> <p>1) <b>yes</b>;</p> <p>2) no;</p> <p>3) in the current formulation, it is impossible to verify the novelty of the provision.</p> <p>7.4 Level of applicability:</p> <p>1) narrow;</p> <p>2) medium;</p> <p>3) <b>broad</b>;</p> <p>4) in the current formulation, it is impossible to determine the level of applicability of the provision.</p> <p>7.5 Has it been proven in the article?</p> <p>1) <b>yes</b>;</p> <p>2) no;</p> <p>3) in the current formulation, it is impossible to verify whether the provision has been proven in the article.</p>	<p>An original interpretation is introduced of women's social activism as a stable form of initiative-based action aimed at compensating for resource and organizational deficits in the implementation of public administration tasks. Activism is considered a form of participation with institutionalization potential and the capacity to be integrated into existing governance mechanisms at both national and local levels.</p> <p>Proposition 2.</p> <p>A quantitative approach is developed for assessing women's social activism based on Z-score standardization and correlation-regression analysis. A model is constructed that allows the identification of relationships between women's individual characteristics and the effectiveness of social program implementation. Stable forms of participation are identified, which can be characterized as institutionally reproducible within socially oriented administrative processes.</p> <p>Proposition 3.</p> <p>A dependency is established between the level of education and the intensity of women's social activism in the social sphere. It is revealed that an increase in educational attainment raises the likelihood of women's involvement in the implementation of public policy tasks, primarily in the areas of social protection and healthcare.</p> <p>Proposition 4.</p> <p>A model of interaction between public structures and women's associations is developed using the case of palliative care. The model presents a mechanism for integrating women's social activism into overcoming functional constraints of the public system—through volunteer activity, consultative participation, and organizational-coordinative support formats. The potential applicability of this approach to other areas of social policy is noted.</p> <p>Proposition 5.</p> <p>Key barriers and conditions influencing the institutionalization of women's social activism within the public system are identified. Regulatory, administrative, and resource constraints are established that reduce the stability of such forms of participation. Directions are substantiated for adapting organizational and managerial mechanisms to broaden women's engagement in the implementation of social policy programs.</p>
8.	Principle of reliability. Reliability of sources and provided information	<p>8.1 Is the choice of methodology justified or is the methodology described in sufficient detail?</p> <p>1) <b>yes</b>;</p> <p>2) no.</p>	<p>The methodological foundation of the dissertation is structured consistently and corresponds to the research aim and objectives. The approach is based on the study of the institutionalization processes of women's social activism—the transition from initiative-based actions to recognized and integrated forms of participation within public administration mechanisms. It draws upon concepts of public administration, institutional analysis, and human resource management. The theoretical component relies on studies in the fields of social policy, public administration, and gender analysis. The empirical component includes statistical processing, Z-score standardization, correlation-regression analysis, and case analysis using the example</p>

			of palliative care. The methodology encompasses both public and institutional levels, ensuring the evidential validity of the conclusions obtained.
		8.2 The results of the dissertation work were obtained using modern scientific research methods and data processing and interpretation techniques involving computer technologies: 1) <b>yes</b> ; 2) no.	The results of the dissertation research were obtained using modern methods of scientific analysis. Procedures of quantitative data processing were applied, including correlation-regression analysis and data standardization. Visualization and interpretation tools were employed, along with methods for analyzing large arrays of statistical information. Within the framework of qualitative analysis, the ATLAS.ti software package was used for processing survey materials and conducting case analysis of examples of women's social activism in the palliative care sector. The integrated use of digital and analytical instruments ensured the accuracy of the empirical result interpretation.
		8.3 Theoretical conclusions, models, identified relationships and patterns are proven and confirmed by experimental research (for educational science programs, the results are confirmed based on a pedagogical experiment): 1) <b>yes</b> ; 2) no.	Theoretical conclusions, models, identified relationships, and patterns are <b>substantiated and confirmed</b> by empirical research. The results demonstrate the stability of the revealed dependencies and the consistency of the formulated propositions with the actual practice of public administration.
		8.4 Key statements <b>are confirmed</b> / partially confirmed / not confirmed by references to relevant and reliable scientific literature.	The statements are <b>confirmed</b> by references to relevant studies by domestic and international authors, reflecting institutional aspects of women's social activism, approaches to the transformation of women's participation in governance, as well as contemporary approaches in the field of public social policy.
		8.5 The sources of literature used <b>are sufficient</b> / not sufficient for the literature review	The sources used encompass a wide range of theoretical and applied works, providing the necessary breadth of review for analyzing institutionalization mechanisms, models of interaction between women's associations and public structures, and for assessing the inclusion of women in the implementation of social governance tasks.
9	Принцип практической ценности	9.1 The dissertation has theoretical significance: 1) <b>yes</b> ; 2) no.	The theoretical significance of the dissertation research lies in the refinement of the conceptual framework, including the author's interpretation of women's social activism as an institutionally applicable form of participation in public administration mechanisms. Relationships are established between the level of education, forms of participation, and the potential for integrating women's initiatives into the administrative system. The formulated propositions expand scientific understanding of the role of women in the implementation of social policy objectives and may be used in educational courses on public and local administration, as well as in the training of specialists in the field of public administration.
		9.2 The dissertation has practical significance, and there is a high probability of applying the obtained results in practice: 1) <b>yes</b> ; 2) no.	The practical significance of the dissertation lies in the development of applied mechanisms aimed at the institutionalization of women's social activism within the public administration system. The presented models of interaction with government bodies and the tools for assessing women's participation in the implementation of social policy objectives can be used in the design of administrative decisions, as well as in strategic and program-targeted planning. The



			proposed provisions are applicable for enhancing the effectiveness of interdepartmental and territorial programs involving women's organizations.
		9.3 The proposals for practice are new: 1) <b>completely new</b> ; 2) partially new (25–75% are new); 3) not new (less than 25% are new).	The proposals formulated in the dissertation possess a <b>high degree of novelty</b> . Original methodological approaches to the assessment of women's social activism are presented; a model of its impact on governance in the social sphere is developed; mechanisms of institutionalization are refined; and directions for support at the level of program-targeted planning are proposed. The content of the recommendations is oriented toward practical application within the framework of public social policy and human resource management.
10.	Quality of writing and design	Quality of academic writing: 1) <b>high</b> ; 2) average; 3) below average; 4) low.	The dissertation text complies with the standards of academic writing, is presented in conceptually precise and scientifically substantiated form, and is formatted in accordance with the requirements of academic ethics and citation standards. The methodological developments and managerial proposals presented are structured within a unified analytical framework and possess applied validity.
11.	Notes to the dissertation	The institutional context in which women's social activism is considered as a managerial resource requires clarification, particularly with regard to the delineation of functions at the levels of public and local administration.	
12.	The scientific level of the doctoral candidate's articles on the research topic (In the case of defending the dissertation in the form of a series of articles, the official reviewers shall comment on the scientific level of each article by the doctoral candidate on the research topic.)	The main results of the dissertation work have been published in 1 collective monograph, 1 author's certificate, and 11 scientific publications, including 3 articles published in journals indexed in the Scopus database with a percentile above 35, 4 articles in journals recommended by the Committee for Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Science (CQAHES), and 4 in the proceedings of international scientific and practical conferences. The content of the publications generally corresponds to the topic and objectives of the dissertation research, reflecting its aims and main results.	
13.	Decision of the official reviewer (in accordance with paragraph 28 of the present Model Regulation)	to award a degree of a doctor of philosophy (PhD) in the educational program «8D04101 – Public and Local Administration».	

Based on the above, I believe that Kenzhegulova Gaukhar Koblanovna's dissertation on the topic: «The role of women social behaviour transformation in Public Administration» meets the requirement of the Degree Awarding Rules and the applicant deserved to be awarded a degree of a doctor of philosophy (PhD) in the educational program «8D04101 – Public and Local Administration».

**The official reviewer,**

PhD,

Senior Lecturer of the Department of Regional Studies,

Faculty of International Relations,

L.N. Gumilyov Eurasian National University

Date: 20.06.2025



**Bekebayeva A.D.**

