

**Written review by the official reviewer of Kenzhegulova Gaukhar Koblanovna's dissertation on the topic:  
“The role of women social behaviour transformation in Public Administration” for a doctor of philosophy (PhD) in the educational program 8D04101 –  
Public and Local Administration**

No.	Criteria	Compliance with the criteria (underline one of the options)	Justification of the official reviewer's position (italicized remarks)
1.	The topic of the dissertation (as of the date of its approval) corresponds to the directions of scientific development and/or state programs.	1.1 Compliance with priority areas of science development or government programs: 1) the dissertation was completed within the framework of a project or target program funded from the state budget (specify the name and number of the project or program); <b>2) the dissertation was completed within the framework of another state program (specify the name of the program);</b> 3) the dissertation corresponds to the priority area of science development approved by the Higher Scientific and Technical Commission under the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan (specify the direction).	The dissertation corresponds to the implementation areas of the following strategic and program documents: – Address of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan, K.-J. Tokayev, to the people of Kazakhstan “Just Kazakhstan: law and order, economic growth, social optimism” dated September 2, 2024; – Concept for the development of public administration in the Republic of Kazakhstan until 2030: Building a “Human-Centered” Model – “People First”; – National Action Plan of the Republic of Kazakhstan for Promoting Equal Rights and Opportunities for Men and Women for 2024–2027; – State Program for Healthcare Development of the Republic of Kazakhstan for 2020–2025, which provides for the expansion of social support mechanisms and the inclusion of the civil sector, in particular through initiatives in the field of palliative care; – Concept of family and gender policy in the Republic of Kazakhstan until 2030. Thus, the topic of the dissertation corresponds to the strategic priorities outlined in national program documents, including areas of development in public and local administration, as well as gender policy and sustainable social development.
2.	Importance for science	The work <b>makes</b> /does not make a significant contribution to science, and its importance is <b>well disclosed</b> / not disclosed.	This work makes a noticeable contribution to science. A comprehensive set of theoretical and methodological approaches to the study of women's social activism in the context of managerial processes has been systematized. Based on the analysis of domestic and international studies, the conceptual framework has been clarified, a typology of participation forms has been developed, and institutional barriers affecting women's involvement in the sphere of public and local administration have been identified. The research contributes to solving an important problem, enhancing the level of women's social activism in the system of public administration, specifically: – based on the analysis of gender theories and institutional models, an original interpretation of the concept of “women's social activism” is proposed, understood as a form of purposeful participation of women in the transformation of social structures through political, economic, and social mechanisms; – an economic and mathematical model has been developed to assess the impact of the level of women's social activism on the effectiveness of public administration, using correlation-regression analysis and Z-score standardization of data;

			<p>– a partnership model between the state and civil society has been proposed, based on the integration of women's initiatives and tested in the field of palliative care, with the potential for adaptation to other sectors of social policy;</p> <p>– a systematization of the factors influencing the level of women's involvement in decision-making processes has been carried out, with particular emphasis on the role of education, institutional incentives, and cultural norms;</p> <p>– the necessity of institutionalizing women's leadership and strengthening gender expertise mechanisms in the implementation of government programs and strategies has been substantiated.</p>
3.	Principle of independence	<p>Level of independence:</p> <p>1) <b>high</b>;</p> <p>2) medium;</p> <p>3) low;</p> <p>4) no independence.</p>	<p>The dissertation is characterized by a sufficient level of independence on the part of the doctoral candidate, which is expressed in the originality of the formulation of the scientific problem, the author's interpretation of the phenomenon of women's social activism, and the independent development of methodological solutions.</p>
4.	Principle of internal coherence	<p>4.1 Justification of the relevance of the dissertation:</p> <p>1) <b>justified</b>;</p> <p>2) partially justified;</p> <p>3) not justified.</p>	<p>The dissertation research is characterized by integrity and structural completeness. The thematic sections are interconnected and aligned with the overall objective, which ensures a unified approach to addressing the studied issues.</p> <p>The relevance of the dissertation research is determined by the need to enhance the institutional effectiveness of public and local administration through the development and implementation of mechanisms for the institutionalization and advancement of women's social activism as a resource for fulfilling the priority areas of social policy through the institutionalization and support of women's social activism within the public administration system.</p> <p>The subject of analysis includes forms of civic activity that possess an applied orientation and are aimed at addressing issues traditionally within the responsibility of state structures. The doctoral candidate substantiates that social activism serves as an important instrument for transforming the system of public and local administration through active civic participation, including that of women, contributing to increased openness, accountability, and efficiency of government bodies.</p> <p>The development of institutional foundations for women's social activism enhances the effectiveness of public administration in the social sphere through the inclusion of sustainable forms of civic initiative in administrative practice.</p> <p>The practice of women's participation in palliative care, local educational initiatives, and support programs for vulnerable groups demonstrates the potential of social mobilization in compensating for managerial deficits. Such forms of involvement help to strengthen the resilience of the public and local administration system by expanding mechanisms of cooperation with society.</p> <p>The relevance of the research is also determined by the need to expand effective mechanisms for involving civic initiatives in public administration and eliminating structural barriers that hinder their development.</p> <p>The dissertation offers systematically structured solutions for integrating such practices into existing organizational and economic frameworks, which underscores its applied orientation.</p>



	<p>4.2 The content of the dissertation reflects the topic of the dissertation:</p> <p>1) <b>reflects</b>;  2) partially reflects;  3) does not reflect.</p>	<p>The content of the dissertation research corresponds to its major topic and is aimed at the theoretical comprehension of the possibilities for improving the effectiveness of public and local administration through the institutionalization of civic activity forms among the female population.</p> <p><b>The first chapter</b> reveals the theoretical and methodological foundations of the development of women's social activism in public administration, including the evolution of feminist concepts, approaches to defining social activism, and the selection of the research methodology.</p> <p><b>The second chapter</b> presents an analysis of the current state of women's social activism in Kazakhstan and its impact on public administration, taking into account educational factors and the empirical assessment of involvement.</p> <p><b>The third chapter</b> outlines the key directions and mechanisms of institutional development of women's social activism, including proposals to strengthen the role of NGOs, educational and economic activity, as well as tools for state support and institutionalization.</p> <p>The conclusion summarizes the main results of the dissertation research and contains recommendations oriented toward practical application in the public administration system, aimed at the institutional development of women's social activism.</p>
	<p>4.3. The objective and tasks correspond to the topic of the dissertation:</p> <p>1) <b>correspond</b>;  2) partially correspond;  3) do not correspond.</p>	<p>The objective of the dissertation research is formulated as the development of recommendations for enhancing women's social activity in the system of public administration and for their integration into the implementation of state social programs of the Republic of Kazakhstan. This objective directly follows from the topic and defines the methodological orientation of the research.</p> <p>To achieve the objective, the following tasks have been formulated:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>– to reveal the theoretical foundations of the formation and development of women's social activism in public administration, considering roles;</li> <li>– to systematize foreign models of women's activism and the mechanisms of their involvement in the practice of public administration;</li> <li>– to analyze the impact of women's social activity on the effectiveness of public administration in Kazakhstan using the correlation-regression method with data standardization based on Z-scores;</li> <li>– to assess the degree of influence of women's education level on their participation indicators in administrative activities;</li> <li>– to formulate institutional mechanisms for supporting women's activism and to define the conditions for their integration into public administration processes;</li> <li>– to develop practice-oriented proposals for expanding women's participation in the implementation of state social programs.</li> </ul> <p>All the above-stated objectives and tasks are presented in the content of the dissertation in a logical sequence, which ensures their alignment with the research topic and the coherence of the scientific presentation.</p>
	<p>4.4 All sections and provisions of the dissertation are logically interconnected:</p> <p>1) <b>fully interconnected</b>;  2) partially interconnected;</p>	<p>All sections and provisions of the dissertation are fully interconnected and characterized by the unity and interdependence of the problem, objective, tasks, methods of theoretical and practical research, and the obtained results.</p>

	<p>3) not interconnected.</p> <p>4.5 The new solutions (principles, methods) proposed by the author are substantiated and evaluated in comparison with known solutions:  1) <b>critical analysis is present</b>;  2) analysis is partial;  3) analysis consists not of original opinions but of quotations from other authors;  4) analysis is absent.</p>	<p>The solutions proposed by Kenzhegulova G.K. are substantiated and evaluated based on a critical analysis of the research conducted and a review of scientific articles in the relevant field.</p>
5. Principle of scientific novelty	<p>5.1 Are the scientific results and provisions new?  1) <b>completely new</b>;  2) partially new (25–75% are new);  3) not new (less than 25% are new).</p>	<p>The results of the dissertation research possess scientific novelty and represent a contribution to the development of the theory and practice of public administration. The scientific novelty is expressed in the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>– the author proposes a definition of women's social activism in the context of public administration as an institutionally significant form of participation in socio-economic development;</li> <li>– a methodology has been developed for the quantitative assessment of the level of social activism and its impact on public administration performance indicators, based on the application of correlation-regression analysis and data standardization using the Z-score method;</li> <li>– an economic-mathematical model has been constructed to assess the impact of women's social activism parameters on public administration efficiency, allowing the evaluation of the degree of involvement based on managerial indicators;</li> <li>– correlations have been identified between the level of education and the degree of women's participation in administrative and social processes at the local level;</li> <li>– the stages of institutionalization of women's initiatives have been analyzed using the case of the palliative care system, and their influence on the implementation of public administration functions in the social sphere has been characterized;</li> <li>– organizational and economic recommendations have been formulated for the inclusion of socially active civic initiatives in the mechanisms of public program implementation, taking into account international practices and the institutional specifics of Kazakhstan.</li> </ul>
	<p>5.2 Are the conclusions of the dissertation new?  1) <b>completely new</b>;  2) partially new (25–75% are new);  3) not new (less than 25% are new)</p>	<p>The conclusions and recommendations presented in the dissertation are grounded on the conducted research, which is based on generally accepted scientific approaches and methodological tools, thereby adding further credibility to the work. The obtained results are based on the analysis of both domestic and foreign literature on the issues under consideration, as well as the study of existing concepts, methodologies, and scientifically grounded recommendations in the field of public and local administration. These results are new and reflect the key provisions of the institutionalization of women's social activism within the system of public administration.</p>



		<p>5.3 Technical, technological, economic, or managerial decisions are new and justified:</p> <p>1) completely new;  2) <b>partially new (75% are new)</b>;  3) not new (less than 25% are new)</p>	<p>The proposed managerial and organizational-economic solutions aimed at the institutionalization of women's social activism in the field of public administration possess elements of novelty. In particular:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>– a model for integrating socially active initiatives into the mechanisms for implementing government programs aimed at addressing social policy objectives at regional and municipal levels has been substantiated;</li> <li>– an approach has been proposed for structuring the interaction between initiative-based civil communities and public administration bodies under conditions of resource and personnel shortages;</li> <li>– organizational and economic parameters ensuring the formalization and sustainability of such forms of participation within the existing administrative system have been defined;</li> <li>– recommendations have been developed for regulatory and institutional support of women's civic participation practices in the management of socially significant sectors, based on the principles of adaptability and engagement.</li> </ul> <p>The recommendation about the application of project management in public governance and social activism initiatives is partially new since it has been already applied in other countries.</p>
6.	Validity of the main conclusions	All the main conclusions <b>are based</b> / not based on scientifically significant evidence or are well-founded enough (for qualitative research and areas of study in the arts and humanities)	<p>The main conclusions of the study are substantiated based on a set of theoretical, empirical, and regulatory sources. Each section of the dissertation forms consistent provisions supported by data from correlation-regression analysis, indicator standardization using the Z-score method, as well as analytical generalization of the experience of interaction between civil initiatives and government bodies. The argumentation is built upon relevant scientific publications, regulatory legal documents, statistical sources, and state reporting materials, which ensures the evidential robustness of the proposed recommendations and increases their applicability in the public administration system.</p>
7.	The main provisions submitted for defense	<p>It is necessary to answer the following questions for each provision separately:</p> <p>7.1 Has the provision been proven?  1) <b>proven</b>;  2) rather proven;  3) rather not proven;  4) not proven;  5) in the current formulation, it is impossible to verify the validity of the provision.</p> <p>7.2 Is it trivial?  1) yes;  2) <b>no</b>;</p>	<p>Provision 1.</p> <p>The author proposes a definition of women's social activism as an institutionalizable form of participation aimed at addressing resource and organizational deficits in public administration in the fields of social policy, healthcare, and local self-government. Such participation is manifested through initiative-driven and sustainable actions that can be integrated into the execution of administrative functions while complying with official procedures and competencies.</p> <p>Applicability assessment: Broad. The definition meets the requirements of governmental and program-targeted planning and can be used in the development of gender-sensitive measures within national and regional programs.</p> <p>Provision 2.</p> <p>A quantitative approach has been developed to assess women's participation in the public administration system based on Z-score standardization and correlation regression analysis. Its uniqueness lies in the construction of a scale for evaluating the level of involvement, allowing the correlation of participants' characteristics with the performance indicators of state social program</p>

	<p>3) in the current formulation, it is impossible to verify the triviality of the provision.</p> <p>7.3 Is it new? 1) <b>yes</b>; 2) no; 3) in the current formulation, it is impossible to verify the novelty of the provision.</p> <p>7.4 Level of applicability: 1) narrow; 2) medium; 3) <b>broad</b>; 4) in the current formulation, it is impossible to determine the level of applicability of the provision.</p> <p>7.5 Has it been proven in the article? 1) <b>yes</b>; 2) no; 3) in the current formulation, it is impossible to verify whether the provision has been proven in the article.</p>	<p>implementation. The methodology is oriented toward analyzing how stable forms of women's participation can be institutionally integrated into public administration practices.</p> <p>Applicability assessment: Broad. The approach is reproducible and can be used in the evaluation of the implementation of state programs in the social sphere.</p> <p>Provision 3.</p> <p>A correlation has been established between women's education level and their transition from informal initiatives to participation in public administration institutions. The analysis demonstrates that a higher level of women's education contributes to the sustainable development of their civic engagement in the social sphere and enhances the contribution of such forms of participation to achieving goals aimed at improving access to social services, protecting vulnerable groups, and advancing public initiatives within the system of public administration.</p> <p>Applicability assessment: Broad. The results can be used in the formation of personnel and gender policies in state and local administration aimed at increasing women's participation in decision-making processes.</p> <p>Provision 4.</p> <p>A partnership model between public institutions and women's associations in the field of palliative care is presented. The model is based on the inclusion of civil initiatives in the execution of functions constrained by limited administrative capacity and describes the sequence of integration of such forms of participation as volunteer assistance, consulting services, and organizational support activities.</p> <p>Applicability assessment: Medium. The model has been tested in a specific area (palliative care) and has the potential for scaling to other areas of social policy, including social protection, local education, and healthcare.</p> <p>Provision 5.</p> <p>Institutional prerequisites, barriers, and regulatory mechanisms affecting the integration of women's social activism into public and local governance processes have been systematized. Legal prerequisites, administrative barriers, and resource constraints have been identified as influencing the sustainable participation of women's social activism in program-targeted and project mechanisms of state and local administration.</p> <p>Applicability assessment: Broad. The provision reflects the applied potential of the dissertation research results and can be used in the development of administrative decisions aimed at the institutional inclusion of women's social activism in the practices of public and local administration.</p>
8.	<p>Principle of reliability. Reliability of sources and</p>	<p>8.1 Is the choice of methodology justified or is the methodology described in sufficient detail? 1) <b>yes</b>;</p> <p>The choice of methodology in the dissertation is justified and consistently presented. The methodological framework includes the analysis of the phenomenon of women's social activism and the processes of its institutional integration into the system of public administration, based on the principles of public administration theory, institutional analysis, and human capital</p>



provided information	<p>2) no.</p> <p>8.2 The results of the dissertation work were obtained using contemporary scientific research methods and data processing and interpretation techniques involving computer technologies: 1) <b>yes</b>; 2) no.</p> <p>8.3 Theoretical conclusions, models, identified relationships, and patterns are proven and confirmed by experimental research (for educational science programs, the results are confirmed based on a pedagogical experiment): 1) <b>yes</b>; 2) no.</p> <p>8.4 Key statements <b>are confirmed</b> / partially confirmed / not confirmed by references to relevant and reliable scientific literature.</p> <p>8.5 The sources of literature used <b>are sufficient</b> / not sufficient for the literature review</p>	<p>management. The theoretical part is grounded in the works of domestic and international researchers in the fields of social policy, public administration, and gender studies. The empirical component is represented by statistical analysis, data standardization using the Z-score method, correlation-regression models, and case analysis based on the example of the palliative care sector. The methodology corresponds to the research objectives and covers both the macro level (public policy) and the institutional level (women's social activism as a form of participation in managerial practices).</p> <p>The results of the dissertation research were obtained using methods of scientific analysis. Quantitative analysis methods were employed, including correlation-regression modeling and Z-score standardization, with calculations implemented in the Python software environment. Tools for data visualization and interpretation were applied, as well as means for processing statistical data sets by region. The methodologies were tested based on the analysis of survey data, including case analysis of women's social activism initiatives in the field of palliative care, which confirms the correctness of using digital tools for interpreting the results.</p> <p>The conclusions, models, and identified relationships formulated in the dissertation research are substantiated by empirical material. A quantitative analysis was conducted using Z-score standardization and correlation-regression modeling based on data collected through surveys and content analysis. The testing of hypotheses regarding the influence of education level on forms of women's social and administrative involvement, as well as the institutional testing of the partnership model in the field of palliative care, made it possible to confirm the identified relationships. The results demonstrate the features of the transformation of women's social behavior under conditions of the absence of formalized support mechanisms and highlight the importance of institutional recognition of women's social activism. The justifications are based on statistical correlations and institutional case studies, which ensure the scientific validity and substantiation of the presented conclusions.</p> <p>The statements are supported by references to relevant and diverse foreign and domestic scientific literature, including journal articles, national statistical collections, and bulletins, and books.</p> <p>The used sources of literature provided a detailed literature review regarding feminism development, including social activism and are sufficient to cover the topic and ensure a comprehensive understanding of the context.</p>
9 Principle of practical significance	<p>9.1 The dissertation has theoretical significance: 1) <b>yes</b>; 2) no.</p>	<p>The theoretical significance of the dissertation research lies in the development of the conceptual framework, including the author's definition of women's social activism as an institutionally applicable form of involvement in public administration mechanisms. The relationships between education level, forms of participation, and the degree of integration of women's initiatives into the administrative system have been clarified. The methodology for the quantitative assessment of involvement using Z-score and correlation-regression analysis contributes to the expansion of the toolkit for studying social participation in administrative practices. The research materials can be</p>



		<p>9.2 The dissertation has practical significance, and there is a high probability of applying the obtained results in practice:</p> <p>1) <b>yes;</b> 2) <b>no.</b></p> <p>9.3 The proposals for practice are new: 1) <b>completely new;</b> 2) partially new (25–75% are new); 3) not new (less than 25% are new).</p>	<p>used in educational programs on public and local administration, as well as in the training of personnel in the field of public administration.</p> <p>The practical significance of the dissertation lies in the possibility of applying the developed provisions and methodologies within the framework of gender-sensitive state policy and program-targeted management. Specific proposals are presented for the institutionalization of women's social activism, including partnership models with government structures, methods for assessing involvement in administration, and mechanisms for supporting initiatives at the regional level. The results can be used in the development of strategies for involving the civil sector in public and local administration processes, as well as in formulating recommendations to enhance the effectiveness of implementing social programs with the participation of women's organizations.</p> <p>The dissertation research presents recommendations that are not reflected in current regulatory documents and administrative practices. Original solutions are proposed aimed at the institutionalization of social activism as a resource for enhancing the effectiveness of public administration. Approaches to standardized quantitative assessment of civic participation have been developed and adapted to the objectives of program-targeted planning. Proposals have been formulated for the regulatory integration of initiatives into public administration mechanisms, including the educational, social, and administrative spheres.</p>
10.	Quality of writing and design	<p>Quality of academic writing:</p> <p>1) <b>high;</b> 2) average; 3) below average; 4) low.</p>	<p>The proposals developed in the dissertation research are aimed at improving the mechanisms of public administration through the integration of social activism into administrative processes. The methodological approaches presented are not reflected in existing regulatory acts and administrative practices. The recommendations for the institutional strengthening of women's social activism, the quantitative models for assessing involvement, and the proposed algorithms for interaction with public authorities form a foundation for the managerial application of non-governmental initiatives within the framework of public administration.</p> <p>The presented methodological approaches and directions for their practical implementation are not reflected in current regulatory acts and administrative practices. The developed approach to the institutional inclusion of stable forms of women's social activism into the structure of public administration, the construction of quantitative models for assessing administrative involvement, as well as the algorithms for interaction between initiative groups and government institutions, are characterized by a high degree of applied novelty and may be used within the system of public and local administration. The dissertation contains some typos. The quality of academic writing meets the general requirements.</p>
11.	Notes to the dissertation	There are certain remarks regarding the need to stipulate details on the interviewees' social and demographic characteristics in the second chapter and to specify the particular features of women's social activism as a managerial resource in the context of public and local administration.	
12.	The scientific level of the doctoral candidate's	The main results of the dissertation work have been published in 1 collective monograph, 1 author's certificate, and 11 scientific publications, including 3 articles published in journals indexed in the Scopus database with a percentile above 35, 4 articles in journals recommended by the Committee for Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Science (COAHES), and 4 in the proceedings of international scientific and practical conferences. The content of the publications generally corresponds to the topic and objectives of the dissertation research, reflecting its aims and main results.	



	articles on the research topic (In the case of defending the dissertation in the form of a series of articles, the official reviewers shall comment on the scientific level of each article by the doctoral candidate on the research topic.)	
13.	The decision of the official reviewer (by paragraph 28 of the present Model Regulation)	To award a degree of a Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) in the educational program "8D04101 – Public and Local Administration".

Based on the above, Kenzhegulova Gaukhar Koblanovna's dissertation on the topic: "The role of women's social behavior transformation in Public Administration" meets the requirements of the Degree Awarding Rules and "Public and Local Administration" EP, and the candidate deserves to be awarded a Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) degree in the educational program "8D04101 – Public and Local Administration".

The official reviewer,  
PhD, Associate Professor  
Almaty Management University

Lipovka A.V.

Date: 10.06.2025

